

PREVIOUS WORKS IN THIS SERIES FROM MCFARLAND

*The Cooperstown Symposium on  
Baseball and American Culture, 2017-2018*

(edited by William M. Simons)

2015-2016 (edited by William M. Simons)

2013-2014 (edited by William M. Simons)

2011-2012 (edited by William M. Simons)

2009-2010 (edited by William M. Simons)

2007-2008 (edited by William M. Simons)

2005-2006 (edited by William M. Simons)

2003-2004 (edited by William M. Simons)

2002 (edited by William M. Simons)

2001 (edited by William M. Simons)

2000 (edited by William M. Simons)

1999 (edited by Peter M. Rutkoff)

1998 (edited by Thomas L. Altherr)

1997 (*Jackie Robinson*) (edited by Peter M. Rutkoff)

The Cooperstown  
Symposium on Baseball  
and American Culture,  
2019 and 2021

*Edited by*  
WILLIAM M. SIMONS



McFarland & Company, Inc., Publishers  
*Jefferson, North Carolina*

# Rigged Elections: The Baseball Hall of Fame's Blacklisting of Marvin Miller<sup>1</sup>

*Peter Dreier*

## *Introduction*

In 1983, the year after Marvin Miller retired following 16 years as executive director of the Major League Baseball Players Association (MLBPA), a top baseball executive said: "The only way Marvin Miller will ever get into the Hall of Fame is through the janitor's entrance."<sup>2</sup>

Thirty-six years later, at its San Diego meeting on December 8, 2019, the National Baseball Hall of Fame and Museum's 16-member Modern Baseball Era Committee voted to induct Miller into the Cooperstown shrine.<sup>3</sup> Miller got 12 out of 16 votes—just enough to meet the 75 percent threshold. Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, the Hall of Fame induction of Miller was delayed, scheduled, as of the time of this writing, for September 8, 2021, in Cooperstown.

One could argue that this story has a happy ending. But the reality is much harsher. Miller had been on the ballot seven previous times but had never received enough votes to get into the Hall of Fame. The clear reason for this is that the Hall of Fame's Board of Directors had stacked the committees with enough owners and executives, including some whom Miller tangled with as head of the players union, to guarantee his exclusion. He didn't even get on the ballot until 2003, 21 years after he retired. He wasn't elected to the Hall of Fame until seven years after he died in 2012 at age 95.

While Miller was being excluded, the Hall of Fame inducted many owners and executives, but none—with the possible exceptions of Branch

Rickey and Bill Veeck—influenced baseball as much as Miller. For decades, the owners and executives on the Hall of Fame board rigged the elections to guarantee that their friends and counterparts would get a plaque on the wall in Cooperstown, denying Miller the honor he deserved.

## *Miller's Accomplishments*

Broadcaster Red Barber, a Ford C. Frick Award recipient, asserted that Miller, Babe Ruth, and Jackie Robinson were "the three most important men in baseball history." Many other players, sportswriters, historians, and others echoed some version of that sentiment.

Professional baseball players had sought several times to unionize since the late 1800s. But until the MLBPA hired Miller in 1966, each effort had failed.<sup>4</sup> The MLBPA is now the most successful labor union in the country. Miller was baseball's Moses, leading the players out of indentured servitude. Under his leadership—which included teaching players about labor history and labor law, giving them a sense of their own power, and training them how to outmaneuver the owners during negotiating sessions—the players won a democratic voice in their workplaces and dramatically improved their pay, pensions, and working conditions.

The players formed the MLBPA in 1953 to deal with their pension issues, purposely called it an "association," rather than a union. At the time, few ballplayers thought that unionizing was a good idea. Most were simply grateful to get paid to play baseball. Few had gone to college. They didn't want to have to return to their hometowns to work in the farms and factories. They weren't about to cause any trouble with team owners, who had almost dictatorial control over their wages and working conditions.

As late as 1963, for example, the Mets' Gene Woodling claimed that players "have it so good that we just don't know what to ask for anymore." Pirates pitcher Bob Friend described baseball's labor-management relations as "utopian." In 1964, Yankees shortstop Tony Kubek, an unusually outspoken ballplayer, said that players should be awarded a share of the profits from MLB's proposed pay-television revenues, suggesting that players were "closer now to a ballplayers' union than we've ever been before." This triggered rebukes from several players. Minnesota Twins outfielder Bob Allison, for example, claimed that relations between players and owners "have never been better" and dismissed the idea that they would resort to unionizing.<sup>5</sup> In 1966, when Miller traveled to spring training sites to meet with players before they voted whether or not to hire him, California Angels first baseman Joe Adcock proclaimed, "Pro sports has no place for unions."<sup>6</sup>

In its first 13 years, the MLBPA was a paper tiger, with no full-time staff, no office, a tiny budget, and no strategy. Star players Allie Reynolds, Ralph Kiner, Sandy Koufax, Don Drysdale, Jim Bunning, and Robin Roberts helped lay the groundwork, persuading fellow players that a strong union was needed to improve working conditions and provide adequate pensions. In 1966, despite strong opposition from the owners and from some players, the players voted and selected Miller, a union veteran without any experience in baseball, to run the players association.

Miller, who had previously worked as chief economist and negotiator for the United Steelworkers of America (USWA) union, instructed ballplayers in the basics of trade unionism: fight for your rights to be treated as more than property, stay united against management, prepare for life after baseball, and work on behalf of all players, past and future. Before the union could seriously challenge the owners, Miller had to strengthen the players' resolve. "People today don't understand how beaten down the players were back then," Miller recalled in a 2008 interview. "The players had low self-esteem, as any people in their position would have-like baggage owned by the clubs."<sup>7</sup>

Before Miller, players had no rights to determine the conditions of their employment. They were tethered to their teams through the reserve clause in every player's contract. Those contracts were limited to one season. The contracts "reserved" the team's right to "retain" the player for the next season. Each year, the team owners told players: Take it or leave it. Lacking leverage even superstars went hat-in-hand to owners at the end of the season, begging for a raise.

Two years after Miller took the union's reins, the MLBPA negotiated the first-ever collective bargaining agreement in professional sports. Two years later, the MLBPA established players' rights to binding arbitration over salaries and grievances. Disputes would be settled by independent arbitrators rather than the MLB commissioner, who worked for the owners.

Players also won the right to have agents to negotiate their contracts. In 1969, Miller and the union backed Curt Flood in his lawsuit against MLB regarding the reserve clause. In 1972, Flood lost the lawsuit in the Supreme Court (which ruled that it was up to Congress to change the law regarding MLB's exemption from federal anti-trust laws), but by 1975 Miller had found another way to overturn the reserve clause, through the arbitration process, after identifying a loophole in the reserve clause language. He persuaded Montreal Expos pitcher Dave McNally and Los Angeles Dodgers pitcher Andy Messersmith to play the entire 1975 season without signing contracts. When the season ended, they filed grievances, claiming the right to free agency because there was no contract for their

teams to renew. That December, arbitrator Peter Seitz ruled in favor of the players, essentially ending the reserve clause. During the winter of 1976–77, the first wave of free agents negotiated contracts with substantial salary increases. Reggie Jackson's five-year \$3 million contract with the Yankees made him baseball's highest-paid player.

The new Collective Bargaining Agreement gave players the right to decide for themselves which employer they wanted to work for, to veto proposed trades, and to bargain for the best contract—all cornerstones of an economic free market. The MLBPA also won increased per-diem allowances, improvements in travel conditions and better training facilities, locker room conditions and medical treatment.

In 1967, the minimum MLB salary was \$6,000 (the equivalent of \$47,973 today). By 1970, it increased to \$12,000 (\$82,594 in 2021 dollars). Between 1967 and 1970, the average MLB salary rose from \$19,000 to \$29,303. In 2021 dollars, that's an increase from \$151,906 to \$201,687. By 1980, four years after the arrival of free agency, the minimum salary had increased to \$30,000 (\$97,228 in 2021 dollars) and the average salary grew to \$143,756 (\$465,905 in 2021 dollars). By 2021, both the minimum and average salary had skyrocketed. The minimum salary rose to \$570,500. The average salary increased to \$4,170,000.<sup>8</sup>

Today, median salary is about one-third of the average salary. In other words, most players don't earn close to the average. It bears noting that the 50 highest-paid players receive 33 percent of payroll (an upswing from 28 percent in 2017), and the 100 highest-paid players receive 52 percent, (substantially above the 42 percent of 2017).<sup>9</sup>

Like any good union negotiator, Miller helped the players focus on pension issues. Most professional athletes are lucky to have ten-year careers. The average stay in the major leagues is 5.6 years—even less for pitchers.<sup>10</sup> So increasing payments and shortening the number of years needed to qualify for a pension became critical issues. Today, even baseball players who have short careers have good retirement benefits. Duane Kuiper—a second baseman for the Cleveland Indians and San Francisco Giants from 1974 to 1985—told the *San Francisco Chronicle*, "I don't think any of us really appreciated Marvin until we all got older."<sup>11</sup> "I get a check from Marvin Miller every month. That's my pension," said Bob Locker, who pitched in the majors from 1965 to 1975. "My pension is bigger than any salary I made."<sup>12</sup> "Every time somebody signs one of these wonderful contracts, and there are so many of them out there, I think before they get the first check they should have to write an essay on Marvin Miller," said Rusty Staub, who played in the major leagues from 1963 to 1985.<sup>13</sup>

"The difference between a ballplayer's being required to accept whatever a club offered him, as had been the case almost from the beginning

of professional baseball, and the new system of salary arbitration was like the difference between dictatorship and democracy,” Miller wrote in his 1991 autobiography, *A Whole Different Ball Game*. Miller also sought to raise players’ political awareness. He explained: “We didn’t just explain the labor laws. We had to get players to understand that they were a union. We did a lot of internal education to talk to players about broader issues.”<sup>14</sup>

“That spirit of solidarity reverberated among many players when they were no longer on MLB rosters. In 1982, for example, Brooks Robinson, the former Orioles star third baseman, was a color commentator for games broadcast on WMAR-TV when station employees went on strike, picketing outside the building for two months before the start of the baseball season. The popular Robinson, a member of AFTRA, refused to cross the picket line, which put pressure on management to settle.”<sup>15</sup>

Baseball owners tried desperately to persuade players against joining a union. When the players rejected their advice, the owners, like all business leaders, warned that the union, higher wages, and stronger workplace rules would destroy the industry. They were wrong. In fact, baseball became more popular and prosperous than ever. In 1967, the year after Miller joined the MLBPA, attendance at MLB games averaged 15,005. In 1982, the year he retired, it was 21,161. In 2019, it was 28,203.<sup>16</sup> Baseball’s television revenues have skyrocketed. The economic value of team franchises has climbed sharply. The Yankees, for example, are worth \$4.6 billion. MLB’s gross revenues reached a record-breaking \$10.7 billion in 2019.<sup>17</sup> Among the 30 owners of major league teams, 20 are billionaires. Rather than stifle baseball’s prosperity, the union simply gave players the power to win a greater share of their employers’ growing revenues.

Baseball’s owners hated Miller and the union, which didn’t lose a single important battle in their crusade to improve pay, conditions, and benefits. Owners did everything they could to weaken the union, but Miller and his successors outmaneuvered the owners and their commissioners. Dodgers owner Walter O’Malley lamented, “Marvin Miller is making us look like a bunch of idiots.”<sup>18</sup>

The owners and Commissioners underestimated Miller and the players’ resolve. In 1981, for example, the owners didn’t think the players would be willing to strike. After Miller toured the spring training camps to meet with the players, they voted 967 to 1 to authorize a strike if the two sides couldn’t agree on a new contract. On April 1, 1981, the union’s executive board voted 27–0 to cancel the remainder of spring training games and set a strike date of May 22. In negotiations, the owners refused to budge, prompting players to walk out, in the middle of the season, on June 12, 1981. The owners, and many sportswriters, blamed Miller for that strike

and for subsequent strikes, including the 1994 strike, which occurred 12 years after Miller had retired.

When Miller retired, the union hired his top legal advisor, Donald Fehr, as its new executive director. The owners hoped that without Miller, the union might not be as formidable a foe. Under Fehr, the MLBPA consolidated its economic victories, with one exception: During the 1985 CBA negotiations, the union agreed to raise the required service time for players seeking salary arbitration from two years to three.

During those negotiations, the owners claimed that they were losing money, falsely asserting that MLB had shown a profit only once since 1972. Under the Collective Bargaining Agreement, the owners had to make their financial data available to the MLBPA. Stanford economics professor Roger Noll examined the data and determined that the owners had made profits in 1984. The alleged losses, he discovered, were the result of the team’s shady bookkeeping (for example, lowballing the revenues from TV and radio, parking, and owners’ other businesses) and excessive executive salaries.

Meanwhile, the owners continued their illegal war against free agency and rising salaries. In 1984, after replacing incompetent Commissioner Bowie Kuhn with Peter Ueberroth, the businessman who had organized the successful Olympic Games in Los Angeles, the owners conspired against the players, refusing to sign free agents to multi-year contracts. Not only utility players but also superstars like Tim Lincecum and Andre Dawson received one-year offers at lower salaries than they, and most baseball experts, expected. In most cases, players only received offers from their own teams, indicating that the owners were colluding with each other to avoid bidding wars for players. In 1985, only four of the 62 free agents switched teams.

Fehr recognized the collusion and challenged the owners’ illegal conspiracy. In February 1986, the union filed its first of three arbitration cases charging the owners with illegal collusion. The neutral arbitrator, Thomas Roberts, ruled against the owners. The owners fired Roberts and replaced him with George Nicolau, an experienced arbitrator in sports and other industries. After seven months of hearings, 50 witnesses, and 8,500 pages of testimony, Nicolau also determined that MLB teams had colluded to restrict bidding for free agents. “By common consent, exclusive negotiating rights were, in effect, ceded to former clubs,” he wrote in his 81-page opinion. The union kept filing grievances as new information about the owners’ collusion emerged. In 1988, Nicolau ruled that the owners had devised another way to collude against the players by creating a databank so they could compare salary offers to free agents. In 1990, based on Nicolau’s ruling, lawyers for the players and owners negotiated a \$280 million

settlement for the aggrieved players.<sup>19</sup> Miller was the major expert witness against the owners.

After the owners were found guilty of collusion, players' salaries began to increase, and the gap between large- and small-market teams widened, especially their ability to compete for free agent talent. Under baseball Commissioner Bud Selig, the owners included several proposals in the 1994 CBA negotiations that they knew would antagonize the union. This included elimination of salary arbitration and a restriction of free agency. The owners also insisted that as a quid pro quo for introducing a new revenue-sharing plan among teams, purportedly to help franchises in small-market cities, the players must agree to a salary cap. After fighting for almost three decades to improve their wages, the players would not accept a salary cap under any circumstances. In July 1994, in a move that further angered the players, the owners withheld a \$7.8 million deposit into the players' pension fund. Both the owners and the players expected the other side to back down in order to avoid a strike. Both sides misjudged the other side's resolve.<sup>20</sup>

On July 27, 1994, the players voted to give the union's Executive Board the authority to set a strike date. On August 12, the players went on strike. Almost two weeks later, the MLBPA released a study by Roger Noll, the Stanford University economist, reporting that "baseball is financially healthy" and "the claim of widespread disaster in the sport is pure fiction." In September, the union sent out the first checks from its \$200 million strike fund.

The players hung together. The remainder of the season was cancelled, as was the post-season. The World Series was cancelled for the first time since 1904. As negotiations continued throughout the rest of 1994 and into the following year, President Bill Clinton assigned Labor Secretary Robert Reich to help resolve the strike to no avail.

The owners threatened to hire replacement players if the strike was not settled before spring training in 1995 and began recruiting minor leaguers and former major leagues to serve as strikebreakers. Owner Peter Angelos of the Orioles, a former labor lawyer, refused to field a team of strike-breaking players, despite threats of fines and suspensions from his fellow owners. Tigers manager Sparky Anderson announced that he would refuse to manage a team comprised of replacements. "There ain't no place in our game for replacement players," he said. "The one thing I have that will never leave me is integrity. That is the one thing I have that money can't buy."<sup>21</sup>

The union challenged the owners' strikebreaker plan. The National Labor Relations Board and Sonya Sotomayor, then a federal District Court judge, thwarted the owners' strategy. After 232 days, the strike ended

on April 2, 1995. The contentious negotiations continued for more than another year. The two sides didn't reach an agreement until December 1996, setting terms through 2000. The new CBA included a luxury tax on team payrolls—a form of revenue-sharing—but didn't include any of the owners' proposed changes that had triggered the 1994 strike.

But the strike had repercussions that neither side had anticipated. The cancelling of the World Series, in particular, soured many fans on the game. The baseball writers and TV commentators took a "pox on both your houses" perspective. When play resumed in April 1995, many fans expressed their anger by verbally abusing the players in stadiums around the country. Even though the union had won the strike, Fehr and the other union officials did little to win the fan loyalty although a few players stepped into the breach. After the strike ended, for example, Dodgers catcher Mike Piazza donated \$100 for every home run he hit to the union that represented the concessionaires, who lost considerable pay while 921 games were canceled. It was an individual gesture of empathy with Dodger Stadium's working class—ushers, ticket takers, parking-lot attendants and food vendors—that generated good will among the Dodgers fan base.

In the 2002 agreement, Fehr and the MLBPA allowed the owners to institute revenue sharing and a luxury tax. Although the owners had to pay the tax, it gave them an additional incentive to limit pay raises because the tax kicked in if a team exceeded a certain total salary figure. Nonetheless, minimum salaries continued to increase, arbitration continued, and free agency remained intact.

But the union was gradually resting on its laurels rather than staking out new frontiers. By the early 2000s, however, the MLBPA realized that it needed to educate each new generation of players about the union's history and impact. In 2000, the union began bestowing the Marvin Miller Man of the Year Award to a player "whose on-field performance and contributions to his community inspire others to higher levels of achievement." The union played a key role in getting the Smithsonian Institution's National Portrait Gallery to include Miller's portrait, unveiled in November 2019.<sup>22</sup> In 2019, the 50th anniversary of Curt Flood's court challenge to the reserve clause, the union launched an annual award in honor of Curt Flood, given to "a former player, living or deceased, who in the image of Flood demonstrated a selfless, longtime devotion to the Players Association and advancement of Players' rights."

Pro athletes in other major team sports took note of Miller accomplishment's and eventually won the same bargaining rights as their baseball compatriots. No other figure in history comes close to Miller in terms of his role in revolutionizing the American sports business. So the petty

baseball moguls, determined to win retribution, kept him out of their Cooperstown shrine.

### *Hall of Fame Votes on Miller*

The Hall of Fame is essentially a plutocracy. It is run by a self-selected group of people who served on its Board of Directors, many of whom represent the Hall's founding family or team owners. The board selects the members of the Era committees that vote on which players, umpires, executives, managers, and others will get into the Hall of Fame. The names on the ballot are selected by the Baseball Writers Association of America (BBWAA), but the board sets the rules on how the elections are conducted. The number, size, membership, and purview of the various committees has changed over the years. The committee responsible for deciding on Miller's fate has had different names, including the Veterans Committee, the Expansion Era Committee, and, most recently, the Modern Baseball Era Committee.

The Veterans Committee began in 1939, when Baseball Commissioner Kenesaw Mountain Landis formed the Old-Timers Committee to suggest players from the 19th century for induction into the Hall of Fame. It next met in 1944 to elect Landis, who had died that year. In 1953, the name was changed to Committee on Baseball Veterans. The number of committee members, the frequency of elections, and limits on the number of people who could be elected changed several times between 1953 and 2001, when the Board of Directors adopted another major rule change.<sup>23</sup>

The board's selection of Veterans Committee members has never been very transparent in terms of why and how particular individuals are chosen to represent the three groups—owners and executives, players, and writers. From 1953 through 1966, only one former player (Charles Gehring) served on the Veterans Committee. From 1967 through 1970, Gehring was joined by Frankie Frisch. From 1971 through 2000, the number of players on the Veterans Committee fluctuated from three to six. Former players never constituted a majority on the committee.

In 1981, sports columnist Jack O'Connell of the *Hartford Courant* reported that former Yankee All-Star shortstop and then-broadcaster Tony Kubek was "under consideration" to serve on the Veterans Committee. But, noted O'Connell, that idea was nixed because Kubek, outspoken and pro-union as a player and broadcaster, "may have been perceived as too radical."<sup>24</sup> (During the 1972 strike, for example, Kubek refused to broadcast an interview with Commissioner Bowie Kuhn without also interviewing Miller.)<sup>25</sup>

The names of committee members were typically withheld until a

week or two before they voted. The actual votes have always been kept confidential. In the early 2000s, the Hall of Fame began to announce the number of votes that candidates received but didn't reveal how each committee member voted.

From Miller's retirement in 1982 until 2003, the Veterans Committee met almost every year, but Miller didn't appear on a single Hall of Fame ballot. During that period, a growing chorus of sportswriters and former players, including Hank Aaron, Nolan Ryan, and Tom Seaver, urged the Hall of Fame to put Miller's name on the ballot to no avail.

The alleged reason was that Miller didn't fit any of the categories—player, executive, owner, manager, or umpire—but that was clearly an excuse. The influential members of the Veterans Committee simply didn't want him in the Hall of Fame. During that period, for example, Joe L. Brown, who as general manager of the Pittsburgh Pirates battled Miller and the players union, chaired the Veterans Committee from 1979 to 2001. Bob Broeg, a longtime sports editor and columnist for the *St. Louis Post-Dispatch*, was on the Hall of Fame Board of Directors from 1978 to 2000 as well as on the Veterans Committee from 1971 to 2000. He was considered an ally of the owners (particularly Cardinals owner Augie Busch) and hostile to Miller and the players union.

During those years, the committee voted to induct executives William Hulbert, Lee MacPhail, Happy Chandler, and Bill Veeck, as well as several managers and umpires.<sup>26</sup> Between 2003 and 2017, with Miller's name finally on the ballot, he failed to gain enough votes. Conversely, 2003–2017 Hall of Fame electees included owners and executives Jacob Ruppert, Pat Gillick, Barney Dreyfuss, and Walter O'Malley, as well as former Commissioner Bowie Kuhn.

**Table 1: Hall of Fame Votes on Marvin Miller**

<i>Date</i>	<i>Committee</i>	<i>Votes for Miller</i>	<i>Percentage</i>
February 2003	Veterans	35 out of 79	44%
January 2007	Veterans	51 out of 81	63%
November 2007	Veterans	3 out of 12	25%
December 2009	Veterans	7 out of 12	58%
December 2010	Expansion Era	11 out of 16	69%
December 2013	Expansion Era	"fewer than 6" out of 16	Less than 38%
December 2017	Modern Baseball Era	7 out of 16	44%
December 2019	Modern Baseball Era	12 out of 16	75%

Under the 2001 rules changes, the Veterans Committee would hold elections for players retired over 20 years every other year, and for non-players (managers, umpires, and executives) every four years.<sup>27</sup> They dramatically expanded the Veterans Committee from 15 people to include all living Hall of Fame players and managers, all past winners of the Ford C. Frick and J.G. Taylor Spink (now the BBWAA Career Excellence) awards, and two former members of the Veterans Committee. Rather than convene in person, they would vote by mail, using ballots and supporting materials prepared by the Hall of Fame staff.

This new system was first used in February 2003. The revamped Veterans Committee was comprised of 85 members, including 58 players and managers who were already in the Hall of Fame. Miller finally appeared on the ballot that year. But not a single person on the ballot received the needed 75 percent of the votes. Garnering only 35 out of 79 ballots cast, Miller received 44 percent of the votes.<sup>28</sup>

As *Sports Illustrated* reporter Jay Jaffee pointed out, "Players who played in the pre-union days often resented the high salaries and freedom of movement that their successors enjoyed, and even the most historically-minded writers on the VC disagreed on Miller's eligibility."<sup>29</sup> Even some players who had benefited handsomely from the changes Miller made possible didn't vote for Miller. One was Reggie Jackson, who said that only players should be in the Hall of Fame. Mike Schmidt also didn't vote for Miller but didn't offer an explanation.

Four years later, in January 2007, the Veterans Committee again failed to elect anyone to the Hall of Fame. Miller received 51 out of 81 ballots cast (63 percent).<sup>30</sup> That was 10 votes short of the 61 needed to reach the 75 percent threshold. This time Reggie Jackson stated that he voted for Miller. Miller got considerably more votes than Walter O'Malley (36), Buzie Bavasi (30), Dick Williams (30), Whitey Herzog (29), Bill White (29), Bowie Kuhn (14), August Busch, Jr., (13), Billy Martin (12), Charles Finley (10), and Gabe Paul (10). The tide seemed to be turning in Miller's favor.

A few months after that vote, the Hall of Fame's Board of Directors changed the rules again, explaining their frustration that the Veterans Committee had been pitching shutouts. The Veterans Committee was reconstituted with 12 members picked by the Board. The new committee met in November 2007. This time, Miller received only 3 out of 12 votes—25 percent.<sup>31</sup> Among the 12 members, 7 were owners and executives, guaranteeing that Miller would not get enough votes. The executives included Bobby Brown, a former player who had been an executive with the Rangers and then the American League president. The other six were John Harrington (Red Sox), Jerry Bell (Twins), Bill DeWitt, Jr., (Cardinals),

Bill Giles (Phillies), David Glass (Royals), and Andy MacPhail (Orioles). DeWitt, Giles and MacPhail were legacies whose fathers (and the latter's grandfather) were on the management side during the reserve clause era. Giles, Harrington, and MacPhail were part of management when the players union sued MLB for collusion in the 1980s. Miller was the lead witness during the trial. Soon after Glass assumed leadership of the Kansas City Royals in 1993, he slashed the payroll from \$41 million to \$19 million.<sup>32</sup> During the 1994 strike, Glass adamantly opposed any settlement with the players' union without a salary cap. He supported the use of strikebreaking "replacement" players, despite the court ruling that the use of replacement players violated federal labor law.

The two players on the committee were Monte Irvin and Harmon Killebrew, neither of whom had played a single major league game in the post-reserve clause era. Irvin spent 17 years working for the commissioner's office under Kuhn. Killebrew worked for the Twins as a broadcaster. There were also three media representatives on the committee.

After the vote was taken, it became clear that the Board had revised the makeup of the committee in a way that guaranteed that Miller would not get in. It was stacked with Miller's adversaries. But it also appeared to have been arranged to guarantee that Bowie Kuhn, who had died in March of that year at the age of 80, *would* get in. Indeed, Kuhn and former Pittsburgh Pirates owner (1900–32) Barney Dreyfuss both got 10 out of 12 votes (83%). Former Dodgers owner (1950–79) Walter O'Malley, a staunch anti-union figure who was one of Miller's strongest adversaries, received 9 votes (75%), enough to get in. Two other former owners, Kansas City Royals' Ewing Kauffman (5 votes) and Detroit Tigers' John Fetzer (4 votes), received more than Miller.

Not surprisingly, Hall of Fame chairman Jane Forbes Clark defended the process: "There was no concerted effort other than to have very qualified committee members evaluate very qualified candidates. There was a very open and frank discussion about each of the candidates. Everyone on that committee knows Marvin and respects what he did for the game."<sup>33</sup>

But the scandal of Kuhn's cronies on the Veterans Committee voting him into Cooperstown, while denying Miller entry, provoked considerable outrage. ESPN writer Jerry Crasnick wrote: "Given Miller's mastery over Kuhn in labor-related matters, this was the equivalent of keeping Muhammad Ali out of the Boxing Hall of Fame and electing Chuck Wepner because his face was such a great punching bag."<sup>34</sup> Jim Bouton, who was the player union representative when he played for the Yankees and authored the 1970 best-seller *Ball Four*, contended: "Essentially, the decision for putting a union leader in the Hall of Fame was handed over to a bunch of executives and former executives. Marvin Miller kicked their

butts and took power away from the baseball establishment—do you really think those people are going to vote him in? It's a joke."<sup>35</sup> Bouton later said: "It's like having a cartoon Hall of Fame which admitted Wile E. Coyote and kept out the Roadrunner."<sup>36</sup>

Even Fay Vincent, Baseball Commissioner from 1989 to 1992, expressed dismay. A few days after the vote, he published an op-ed column in *The New York Times* entitled "Union-Busting at the Hall of Fame." He wrote: "There are old men trying to turn back time, to reverse what has happened. Theirs is an act of ignorance and bias. I am ashamed for them. I am ashamed that they represent our game."<sup>37</sup> He later said, "The election of Kuhn and the rejection of Marvin was absurd."<sup>38</sup>

Asked his perspective on the matter, Miller said, "I think it was rigged, but not to keep me out. It was rigged to bring some of these in," referring to Kuhn and the owners. "It's demeaning, the whole thing, and I don't mean just to me. It's demeaning to the Hall and demeaning to the people in it."<sup>39</sup> In May 2008, Miller wrote a letter to the BBWAA, saying he no longer wanted to be considered for the Hall of Fame. He argued that "[t]he anti-union bias of the powers who control the Hall has consistently prevented recognition of the historic significance of the changes to baseball brought about by collective bargaining." Miller criticized the "rigged veterans' committee whose members are handpicked to reach a particular outcome while offering the pretense of a democratic vote." He added, "It is an insult to baseball fans, historians, sports writers and especially to those baseball players who sacrificed and brought the game into the twenty-first century. At the age of 91, I can do without farce."<sup>40</sup>

Despite Miller's letter, the Hall of Fame decision-makers kept his name on the ballot, perhaps, for some, out of spite. But, as *New York Times* columnist William Rhoden wrote at the time, "With all due respect, this issue is larger than the individual." Like others, Rhoden noted that the Hall of Fame was diminished by Miller's absence.<sup>41</sup>

In December 2009, the Veterans Committee met again, using the same rules. Six of the seven owners and executives on the 2007 Veterans Committee were still on it. Two of the three media representatives remained. Two players who have been strong union supporters, Robin Roberts and Tom Seaver, replaced Irvin and Killebrew. To get into the Hall, Miller needed 9 of out 12 votes. He received 7 votes, 58 percent.<sup>42</sup> Assuming that both players and all three media representatives voted for Miller, this meant that two executives did so as well.

After that rebuff, Miller told a reporter: "I'm kind of amused by it. I asked not to be included on any ballots and gave them notice in writing, and they got their backs up and said, 'Nobody can tell us what to do.' It was a reasonable request in light of the circumstances. Why would they keep

putting me on a list and, at the same time, rigging the election so I can't be elected?"<sup>43</sup> But despite Miller's statements, the case for his inclusion was growing while his exclusion became embarrassing.

In July 2010, the Hall of Fame Board of Directors revamped the rules again. Instead of having separate committees based on different occupational categories (players, executives, managers, umpires), the board created three new committees based on historical eras, which they called Pre-Integration Era (1871–1946), Golden Era (1947–72), and Expansion Era (1973 and after). Each era committee would meet every two or three years. Miller was assigned to the Expansion Era committee, which met in December 2010.

In that December 2010 meeting, Miller got closer. The board had expanded the Expansion Era committee to 16 people. This time, there were only four owners and executives on the committee, along with four writers, one manager (Whitey Herzog), and seven players. Miller received 11 out of 16 votes, one vote shy of the 75 percent needed for election.<sup>44</sup> It is likely that the four owners and executives opposed Miller. Who was the fifth anti-Miller vote? Some suspect it was Herzog. But, in truth, we don't know because the votes are kept secret.

In November 2012, Allan Barra, who had helped Miller write his autobiography, visited Miller in his New York City apartment. Miller was ill with terminal liver cancer and knew that it would be the last time he would talk with Barra. During that conversation, Miller said, "If they vote me in after I'm gone, please let everyone you know it is against my wishes and tell them if I was alive I would turn it down."<sup>45</sup> Miller died a few weeks later, on November 27, 2012, at the age of 95.

Miller's death triggered many tributes from sportswriters, players, and others.<sup>46</sup> *Washington Post* columnist Thomas Boswell wrote that thanks to Miller, "the major pro leagues still debate the form in which salaries are set—with salary caps or luxury taxes or revenue-sharing—but no one believes players should be prohibited from switching teams or from discovering the value of their talents in an open market."<sup>47</sup> Fay Vincent reiterated his frustration over Miller's exclusion from the Hall of Fame. In another *New York Times* op-ed column, he wrote: "More than anyone else, he transformed baseball. Yet the failure of the Hall of Fame to recognize the enormous contribution Marvin Miller made to our great game cannot detract from the facts. The shame of his rejection should greatly embarrass those who voted to exclude him."<sup>48</sup>

A year later, in December 2013, the Expansion Era committee voted again. Miller was still on the ballot. The committee had quite a few new faces. There were still four owners, although only one holdover from the previous year, Andy MacPhail, who had served on previous committees.

Former Dodgers manager Tommy Lasorda joined Herzog as managerial representation on the committee. The committee also included four writers and six former players. One of the ex-players, Frank Robinson, was serving as vice president for MLB at the time. Clearly not all the former players voted for Miller, who received “fewer than six” of out 16 votes. (The Hall of Fame refused to release the actual figures).<sup>49</sup> Managers Joe Torre, Tony La Russa, and Bobby Cox were unanimously elected with 16 votes. No one else got the requisite 12 votes.

In 2016, the Hall of Fame changed the rules again. The three era committees were replaced with four committees to consider managers, umpires, executives, and players retired for more than 15 years based on their historical eras. These somewhat arbitrary periods include the Early Baseball era (prior to 1950), the Golden Days era (1950–69), the Modern Baseball era (1970–87), and the Today’s Game committee (1988 to present). Each committee has 16 members. Miller was assigned to the Modern Baseball Era committee.

According to the revised Hall of Fame rules, an Historical Overview Committee, consisting of 10 to 12 members appointed by the BBWAA, decides on the 10 candidates for the ballot. The members of each era committee could vote for up to four candidates.<sup>50</sup> In 2017 and 2019, Miller was the only non-player on the 10-person ballot. He was no longer competing just with other executives, umpires, and managers. That meant that in deciding on whom to vote for, committee members had to make a choice: a vote for Miller meant one less vote for one of the former players on the ballot.<sup>51</sup>

In December 2017, the Modern Baseball Era committee met to vote.<sup>52</sup> Dennis Eckersley, who was serving on the committee for the first time, thought that a positive vote for Miller “was going to be a slam dunk,” he recalled. “Then I figured it out when I got into the room. There are only 16 people there. There are six owners there. Do the math.”<sup>53</sup> Trying to derail Miller’s candidacy, one of the committee members reminded the others that Miller had said that he did not want to be in the Hall of Fame. “Of course, he [Miller] was angry when he said that,” explained Eckersley. “But that’s a weak excuse to not vote him. I saw through that. Baseball is bigger than that.”<sup>54</sup> But only seven of the 16 members (44%) voted for Miller.

### *Players, Sportswriters, and Others Make the Case for Miller*

While the Hall of Fame board and committees were blacklisting Miller, many sportswriters and former players spoke up on his behalf.<sup>55</sup>

In 1983, the year after Miller retired, Ira Berkow of *The New York Times* raised the idea of Miller being in the Hall of Fame. Two years later, player-turned-broadcaster Tony Kubek mentioned on-air that Miller should be in the Hall of Fame. A 1989 *Dallas Morning Herald* column by Blackie Sherrod asked: “How can they have a Hall of Fame without Marvin Miller?”<sup>56</sup> The *New York Daily News*’ Bill Madden minced no words in his sports column: “[T]he Veterans Committee should be ashamed of itself for maintaining this absurd stance that he doesn’t qualify under any of its non-player criteria because he wasn’t a manager, umpire, or executive. Miller ... did more to change the game than anyone other than perhaps Jackie Robinson.”<sup>57</sup>

When Nolan Ryan was inducted into the Hall of Fame in 1999, he paid tribute to Miller. Ryan reminded the audience that when he broke into the majors in 1966, he was earning \$7,000. He spent the winter months working at a gas station while his wife worked at a local bookstore to make ends meet. Because of Miller’s efforts, Ryan said, “we brought that level up to where the players weren’t put in that situation.”<sup>58</sup> In his own Hall of Fame induction speech in 2000, Carlton Fisk (who served on the 2013 Veterans Committee) praised Miller for his role in overturning the reserve clause, creating free agency, and improving working conditions for major league players.<sup>59</sup>

Hall of Famer Brooks Robinson said: “What! Marvin Miller is not in the Hall of Fame? How can that be? I don’t believe it! ... The Baseball Hall of Fame is first a baseball museum, but it is also an educational museum. Marvin Miller belongs there. Let’s make sure he gets there.”<sup>60</sup> Robinson’s statement was a bit disingenuous. He had served as the Baltimore Orioles’ union representative and in 1995 he was invited to join the Hall of Fame Board of Directors. Robinson’s delivered a strong injunction in 2000: “Too many of us [Hall of Fame players] who want this to happen have let it slide for a long time.”<sup>61</sup> Nonetheless, Miller supporters again fell short.

By 2000, many other Hall of Fame players had weighed in on Miller’s behalf. Hall of Famer Jim Bunning, who (along with Hall of Famer Robin Roberts) recruited Miller to the MLBPA (and who, as a Republican U.S. Senator was no friend of unions), said, “The Hall of Fame is about players, and Marvin did more for the players than anyone else.” Bunning said that his two proudest achievements in baseball were his perfect game and helping recruit Miller to lead the players union.<sup>62</sup>

Hall of Famer Tom Seaver, who was also on the Hall of Fame’s Board of Directors and on the 2009 Veterans Committee, called Miller’s exclusion “a national disgrace.”<sup>63</sup> Hall of Famer Hank Aaron wrote that “Miller should be in the Hall of Fame if the players have to break

down the doors to get him in.” Hall of Famer Joe Torre agreed: “Marvin Miller should be in.”<sup>64</sup> Hall of Famer Joe Morgan, who joined the Hall of Fame Board of Directors in 1994 and served on the 2013 Veterans Committee, said: “They should vote him in and then apologize for making him wait so long.”<sup>65</sup> At a memorial for Miller in 2013, Hall of Famer Dave Winfield said, “Anything you do in life, know where you’ve come from, where you are and where you’re going, and Marvin was able to share that with us. Know the history of the players’ association. Know how you got to where you are today.”<sup>66</sup> The MLBPA never waged a public campaign on Miller’s behalf, although they engaged in some quiet diplomacy.

Many other baseball figures agreed that Miller belongs in the Hall of Fame. In 2002, John Henry, owner of the Red Sox, told a *Boston Globe* reporter, “I very much agree that Marvin Miller should be in baseball’s Hall of Fame. How many individuals have played a larger role in the history of the game?”<sup>67</sup> In 2009, Ray Grebey, the former MLB labor negotiator, who went toe-to-toe with Miller, publicly supported Miller’s induction in a letter to the Hall of Fame Board of Directors.<sup>68</sup> In 2017, broadcaster Bob Costas, winner of the Hall of Fame’s Ford C. Frick Award, said, “If I had to pick one person who is missing from the Hall of Fame and I think should be there, it’s Marvin Miller.”<sup>69</sup>

Two MLB Commissioners—Fay Vincent and Bud Selig—made statements arguing that Miller belongs in the Hall of Fame. In 2007, Vincent had written an op-ed column in *The New York Times* on Miller’s behalf. Two years later, he reiterated his view in an interview. “Marvin Miller brought players out of indentured servitude. They were basically slaves. How can you argue that it was anything other than a great thing?”<sup>70</sup> Until Miller is voted into Cooperstown, Vincent said in 2012, “the Hall is diminished.”<sup>71</sup>

Selig, who had tangled with Miller when he owned the Milwaukee Brewers and had fought the players union as Commissioner, recognized the public relations dilemma. In a 2009 interview with the Major League Baseball Network, Selig said: “Marvin Miller belongs in the Hall of Fame, if the criteria is what impact you had on the sport, whatever way one wants to value that impact.”<sup>72</sup> But as Commissioner, Selig did nothing to translate those sentiments into action.

*Sports Illustrated*’s Joe Sheenan wrote, “Marvin Miller is associated with the gains of the MLBPA, particularly free agency, but the knock-on effects of his success with the players helped shape the industry for decades. The need to compete for talent forced teams, and the league, to professionalize all aspects of their business.”<sup>73</sup> In the *Wall Street Journal*, Jared Diamond wrote, “It’s a blight on baseball that Marvin Miller isn’t in

the Hall of Fame already. Bud Selig’s inclusion only shines an ever brighter light on his inexcusable omission.”<sup>74</sup> As MLBPA executive director Tony Clark observed in 2013: “Over the past 50 years, no individual has come close to matching Marvin’s impact on the sport. Marvin’s legacy remains intact, and will only grow stronger, while the credibility of the Hall of Fame continues to suffer.”

### *How Did Miller Get In?*

The Modern Baseball Era Committee next met in December 2019. Miller received 12 out of 16 votes—the threshold needed to win 75 percent of the vote.<sup>75</sup> (This committee also elected catcher Ted Simmons, who received 13 votes). Two years earlier, in 2017, Miller only received 7 out of 16 votes. Six years earlier, in 2013, he received fewer than six votes. How do we account for this vote for Miller? We cannot explain the vote for Miller by any changes in the Hall of Fame’s Board of Directors. The make-up of the board in 2019 was not very different from the make-up two years earlier.<sup>76</sup> Throughout the history of the Hall of Fame, including in 2019, the vast majority of board members have represented the baseball and corporate establishment.

In 2019, the 17-member board was comprised of Chairman Jane Forbes Clark and two close associates of her family’s business enterprises, eight owners and top executives of baseball teams, and six Hall of Fame former players. Three of the board members are members or associates of the wealthy Clark family that runs Cooperstown.

- Jane Forbes Clark is the Chairman of the Hall of Fame Board of Directors. She is the great-great granddaughter of Edward Cabot Clark, the lawyer who patented Singer Sewing Machines and later became president of the company, which provided the source of the family’s wealth. Jane Forbes Clark is the granddaughter of Stephen Carlton Clark (founder of the Hall of Fame) and daughter of Stephen C. Clark, Jr., who also served as Chairman of the Hall of Fame Board of Directors. The Clark family has extensive real estate holdings in the Cooperstown area and is a major philanthropist in the region.<sup>77</sup>
- Kevin Moore serves as the president of The Clark Estates, Inc.
- Edward W. Stack is the past president of the Hall of Fame board (1977–2000) and allied with several other Clark family enterprises.<sup>78</sup>

Eight members of Hall of Fame Board of Directors were MLB owners and/or executives.

- David Glass was the owner of the Kansas City Royals. Strident opponent of settling with the players' union, Glass advocated the use of strikebreaking "replacement" players, despite a court ruling that owners were violating federal labor laws.<sup>79</sup>
- William O. Dewitt, Jr., is the managing partner of the St. Louis Cardinals and previously had financial stakes in other MLB teams.
- Arte Moreno is the owner of the Los Angeles Angels.<sup>80</sup>
- Jerry Reinsdorf owns the Chicago White Sox as well as the Chicago Bulls of the NBA.<sup>81</sup>
- Paul Beeston is the former president of the Toronto Blue Jays.
- Harvey Schiller is the former CEO of YankeeNets and has held many other high-level sport executive positions.
- Thomas Tull, is the former CEO of Legendary Entertainment, a large multimedia company.<sup>82</sup>
- Robert D. Manfred, Jr., is the Commissioner of Major League Baseball.

The owners and executives on the Hall of Fame Board of Directors are a conservative group. Over the past generation, the owners and executives on the Hall of Fame Board of Directors have donated over \$3 million to candidates for president and Congress and political action committees—two thirds of it to Republicans. Jane Forbes Clark made 93 percent of her \$238,000 in political donations to Republicans.

The 2019 Hall of Fame Board of Directors also included six former Hall of Fame players: Brooks Robinson (1955–77), Joe Morgan (1963–84), Phil Niekro (1964–87), Ozzie Smith (1978–96), Cal Ripken, Jr. (1981–2001), and Roberto Alomar (1988–2004). Not one of the ex-players on the board have made any political contributions.<sup>83</sup>

One factor that may have played a key role in the 2019 Modern Baseball Era Committee vote was Tim Mead, who had been named President of the National Baseball Hall of Fame and Museum on April 30, 2019. He had a 40-year career working for the Los Angeles Angels, including the previous 22 years as the team's Vice President of Communications. According to informed but confidential sources, Mead understood that the controversy over Miller was bad for the Hall of Fame's reputation. The source suggested that Mead helped replace some of Miller's harshest opponents on the committee with some executives more sympathetic to Miller.<sup>84</sup>

**Table 2: Members of Modern Baseball Era Committee Votes for Marvin Miller: 2013, 2017, 2019**

2013 (< 6 votes)	2017 (7 votes)	2019 (12 votes)
<i>Owners (o) and Executives</i>		
Jerry Reinsdorf (o)	David Glass (o)	David Glass (o)
Andy MacPhail	Sandy Alderson	Sandy Alderson
David Montgomery (o)	William DeWitt, Jr. (o)	Dave Dombrowski
Paul Beeston	Paul Beeston	Walt Jocketty
	Bob Castellini (o)	Doug Melvin
	John Schuerholz	Terry Ryan
<i>Managers</i>		
Tommy Lasorda	Bobby Cox	
Whitey Herzog		
<i>Writers and Historians</i>		
Steve Hirdt	Steve Hirdt	Steve Hirdt
Bruce Jenkins	Jayson Stark	Bill Center
Jack O'Connell	Bob Elliott	Jack O'Connell
Jim Reeves		Tracy Ringolsby
<i>Former Players</i>		
Frank Robinson*	Dennis Eckersley	Dennis Eckersley
Rod Carew	Rod Carew	Rod Carew
Joe Morgan	George Brett	George Brett
Phil Niekro	Robin Young	Robin Yount
Carlton Fisk	Don Sutton	Ozzie Smith
Paul Molitor	Dave Winfield	Eddie Murray

\*Former MLB player, manager, Vice President (2010–2015).

The non-players on the 2019 Modern Baseball Era Committee were of a slightly different age and outlook from their predecessors. White Sox owner Jerry Reinsdorf, who was part of the owners' collusion scandal in the 1980s and a hardliner during the 1994 strike, was no longer on the committee. Neither was Andy MacPhail, who had served as general manager for several teams and was the Twins' GM during the 1994 strike. Only one of the non-players on the committee, David Glass, was part of the old guard. The former CEO of fiercely anti-union Walmart and the owner of the Kansas City Royals, Glass had served four previous terms on the committee. The other non-players on the 2019 Modern Baseball Era

Committee were executives (general managers) but not owners, and none were in upper management during the years that Marvin Miller headed the players union.

Sandy Alderson had served on the Modern Baseball Era Committee once before, in 2017. A Harvard Law School graduate, he served as the Oakland A's general counsel starting in 1981 and two years later became the GM, serving until 1997. He served as MLB's Executive Vice President for Baseball Operations from 1998 through 2005. He later worked in top positions for the Padres, Athletics, and Mets. Alderson was born in 1947, 12 years younger than Glass but slightly older than the other four executives on the committee. Those four—Dave Dombrowski, Walt Jocketty, Doug Melvin, and Terry Ryan—had never served on the committee before. They were younger than most of the owners and executives who had served on previous versions of the Veterans Committee. They were not the sons of owners or executives who had tangled with Miller.<sup>85</sup>

"You got fresh people in there," observed Eckersley who was on the Modern Baseball Era Committee in 2017 as well as 2019, referring to the executives in the group. "It wasn't just old school folks. It has some different thinkers. Nobody needed coaxing."<sup>86</sup> Only four members of the committee failed to vote for Miller. We don't know who they are, but if all six players and all four writers voted for Miller, then at least two executives cast their ballot for Miller, giving him the 12 votes needed to get into the Hall of Fame. All six Hall of Fame players on the committee (Dennis Eckersley, Robin Yount, George Brett, Rod Carew, Eddie Murray, and Ozzie Smith) took part in the seven-week 1981 players' strike led by Miller.

## Conclusion

The Hall of Fame was diminished by Miller's absence. His plaque on the wall in Cooperstown is a triumph for social justice and workers' rights. But Miller's election is somewhat bittersweet. First, the Hall of Fame's corporate plutocrats waited until seven years after Miller's death to do the right thing. Second, Miller's two children announced that they would boycott the 2020 induction ceremony in Cooperstown in respect for Miller's statements opposing his own election into the Hall of Fame. "It would have been a great honor 20 years ago," his daughter Susan told the Associated Press.<sup>87</sup> Miller's son Peter held his ground: "My father did not wish his name to be placed in nomination for the HOF. And he repeatedly reaffirmed that wish, as well as his desire that I not participate in any HOF activities related to him. So the HOF results this year change nothing. He would of course wish the players elected to the Hall all the best

for this recognition of their accomplishments."<sup>88</sup> Due to the COVID pandemic, the induction ceremony was postponed until September 8, 2021. By then, his children gave their support to allowing one of Miller's long-term MLBPA colleagues to accept the honor on his behalf.

Two unsung former major league pitchers, Bob Tufts and Bob Locker, deserve much of the credit for Miller's election to the Hall of Fame. Tufts, after notable undergraduate accomplishments at Princeton, pitched in the majors from 1981 through 1983. Brilliant and idealistic, Tufts crusaded tirelessly for Miller's induction into the Hall of Fame. Recipient of an MBA degree in finance from Columbia University, Tufts, following his playing days, worked in the financial industry. He also taught courses in business and sports marketing at New York University and even taught a course at NYU about Miller's role in American trade unionism. Sadly, Tufts died in October 2019, two months before Miller was elected. Locker had a ten-year career as a major league pitcher from 1965 to 1975. In April 2010, to coincide with Miller's 93rd birthday, Locker created a website called "Thanks-Marvin.com" to raise awareness of Miller's importance in the worlds of baseball and organized labor, and to push to get Miller into the Hall of Fame. The site included statements from dozens of players, broadcasters, and baseball executives about Miller.

Despite many enthusiastic statements about Miller's accomplishments by former and current ballplayers, including their belief that he deserved a place in the Hall of Fame, it is somewhat shocking that the MLBPA did not mount a public campaign on Miller's behalf. The union failed to embrace a key lesson that Miller taught players after he took over the fledging union: Organize. The union could have mobilized a crusade to get Miller the honor he clearly deserved. The union could have brought together prominent Hall of Fame and rank-and-file players to hold a press conference, issue a statement, and lobby the Hall of Fame board demanding that it put more former players on the Veterans Committee, Expansion Era Committee, and Modern Baseball Era Committee. They could have insisted that the Hall reveal how the committee members voted so they could be held publicly accountable. They could even have organized a players' boycott of the annual Hall of Fame induction ceremonies.

If some high-profile Hall of Fame players, such as Hank Aaron, Sandy Koufax, Dave Winfield, Joe Morgan, and Brooks Robinson, had spoken out collectively on Miller's behalf, it might have put pressure on the Hall of Fame board to appoint a Modern Baseball Era committee not so heavily stacked with owners and executives.

Of the 70 living Hall of Fame players as of 2018, 23 of them<sup>89</sup> started their careers before Miller joined the union in 1966 but played during his tenure, so they directly experienced the improvements that Miller helped

bring about. Another 26 players entered the majors while Miller headed the union and witnessed a steady increase in players' pay, pensions, and power.<sup>90</sup>

### *The Next Battle: Curt Flood*

When pitcher Gerrit Cole signed his \$324 million, nine-year contract with the New York Yankees in December 2019, he paid tribute to Marvin Miller, who had just been elected to the Hall of Fame. Then he paid tribute to Curt Flood. "Challenging the reserve clause was essential to the blossoming sport we have today, which I believe brings out the genuine competitiveness that we have in baseball," Cole said. He went on to say, "I just think it's so important that players know the other sacrifices that players made in order to keep the integrity of the game where it is, and so I hope everybody has that conversation about Curt Flood on the bus."<sup>91</sup>

Cole was right. It has already been 24 years since Flood's death. He belongs in the Hall of Fame—for the combination of his role in changing baseball and for his outstanding play. It is time for the Hall of Fame Board of Directors and the players union to step up to the plate.

### NOTES

1. A version of this article was presented at The Cooperstown Symposium on Baseball and American Culture, cosponsored by the Baseball Hall of Fame and SUNY Oneonta, on June 12, 2021.

2. Ira Berkow, "Sports of the Times; the Master Bargainer," *The New York Times*, January 1, 1983, <https://www.nytimes.com/1983/01/01/sports/sports-of-the-times-the-master-bargainer.html>.

3. The Modern Baseball Era committee is responsible for voting on retired players no longer eligible for election by the Baseball Writers Association of America along with managers, umpires and executives, whose greatest contributions to the game were made during the 1970–87 era.

4. Charles P. Korr, *The End of Baseball as We Knew It: The Players Union, 1960–81*, Champaign: University of Illinois Press, 2002; Lee Lowenfish, *The Imperfect Diamond: A History of Baseball's Labor Wars*, New York: Da Capo Press, 1980; John Helyar, *The Lords of the Realm: The Real History of Baseball*, New York, Ballantine Books, 1995; Robert F. Burk, *Marvin Miller, Baseball Revolutionary*, Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2015; Marvin Miller, *A Whole New Ballgame: The Sport and Business of Baseball*, New York: Birch Lane Press, 1991; Krister Swanson, *Baseball's Power Shift*, Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2016; Michael Hauptert, "Marvin Miller and the Birth of the MLBPA," *Baseball Research Journal*, Spring 2017 <https://sabr.org/research/marvin-miller-and-birth-mlbpa>.

5. Ron Briley, "The Times Were A-Changin': Baseball as a Symbol of American Values in Transition, 1963–64," *Baseball Research Journal*, Vol. 17, 1988, 54–60; Ron Briley, *Class at Bat, Gender on Beck, and Race in the Hole*, Jefferson, NC: McFarland & Company, 2003.

6. Marvin Miller, *A Whole New Ballgame: The Sport and Business of Baseball*, New York: Birch Lane Press, 1991, 38.

7. Peter Dreier and Kelly Candaele, "Hall of Fame Shut Out," *The Nation*, July 22, 2008, <https://www.thenation.com/article/archive/hall-fame-shut-out>.

8. Baseball Reference, Minimum and average salaries 1970–2020 [https://www.baseball-reference.com/bullpen/Minimum\\_salary](https://www.baseball-reference.com/bullpen/Minimum_salary); "Average MLB Salary at \$4.17 Million, Down 4.8% from 2019," *ESPN*, April 16, 2021, [https://www.espn.com/mlb/story/\\_/id/31270164/average-mlb-salary-417-million-48-2019](https://www.espn.com/mlb/story/_/id/31270164/average-mlb-salary-417-million-48-2019).

9. Kelly Candaele and Peter Dreier, "A Tool to Improve Baseball Performance Has Become a Weapon Against the Players," *The Nation*, October 8, 2019. <https://www.thenation.com/article/mlb-moneyball-labor-unions/>.

10. <https://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2007/07/070709131254.htm>.

11. Ron Kroichick, "Pensions in Pro Sports: An Age-Old Issue for All the Big Leagues," *San Francisco Chronicle*, March 18, 2007. <https://www.sfgate.com/sports/kroichick/article/PENSIONS-IN-PRO-SPORTS-An-age-old-issue-for-all-2608929.php>.

12. Phone interview with Bob Locker, December 18, 2018.

13. "Former Players Urge Marvin Miller Be Put in Hall of Fame," *Sports Illustrated*, January 21, 2003, <https://www.si.com/mlb/2013/01/21/marvin-miller-baseball-hall-fame>.

14. Peter Dreier and Kelly Candaele, "Hall of Fame Shut Out," *The Nation*, August 4, 2008, <https://www.thenation.com/article/hall-fame-shut-out/>.

15. Bill Carter, "Agreement Ends Strike at WMAR," *Baltimore Sun*, April 16, 1982.

16. <https://www.baseball-reference.com/leagues/MLB/misc.shtml>.

17. Maury Brown, "MLB Sees Record \$10.7 Billion in Revenues for 2019," *Forbes*, December 21, 2019, <https://www.forbes.com/sites/maurybrown/2019/12/21/mlb-sees-record-107-billion-in-revenues-for-2019/?sh=28c57ee45d78>.

18. Gorden Edes, "Ex-Labor Chief Flattered by Hall Talk," *Boston Globe*, December 15, 2002.

19. Murray Chass, "Baseball; Players Said to Hit Collusion Jackpot," *New York Times*, November 4, 1990, <https://www.nytimes.com/1990/11/04/sports/baseball-players-said-to-hit-collusion-jackpot.html>.

20. Cliff Corcoran, "The Strike: Who Was Right, Who Was Wrong and How It Helped Baseball," *Sports Illustrated*, August 12, 2014. <https://www.si.com/mlb/2014/08/12/1994-strike-bud-selig-orel-hershiser>.

21. Barry Petchesky, "20 Years Ago Today, Sparky Anderson Said NO to Scab Players," *Deadspin*, February 17, 2015, <https://deadspin.com/20-years-ago-today-sparky-anderson-said-no-to-scab-pla-1686368183>.

22. Emma Baccellieri, "Still Waiting on Cooperstown, Marvin Miller Gets a Fitting Induction Elsewhere," *Sports Illustrated*, December 5, 2019, <https://www.si.com/mlb/2019/12/05/marvin-miller-hall-of-fame>.

23. In 1953, the 11-member committee, which included only one former player, elected six former players into the Hall of Fame. Beginning in 1955, the committee met in odd-numbered years to elect up to two players. In 1961, the Veterans Committee was expanded to 12 members and in 1962 it went back to holding annual elections and to electing up to two players a year. In 1971, the committee was limited to electing two players and one non-player each year. But the committee routinely violated these rules, often because former players on the committee pushed to get their friends and teammates into the Hall of Fame with the help of friendly sportswriters on the Veterans Committee. During the 1970s, the committee was criticized for electing too many cronies of the committee members who did not deserve to be in the Hall of Fame. For example, between 1970 and 1973, Frankie Frisch got five of his teammates into the Hall; within three years after Frisch's death in 1973, his allies on the Veterans Committee elected two more of his teammates. In 1978, the Board of Directors increased the committee to 15 members and changed the make-up to include five Hall of Fame players, five owners and executives, and five sportswriters. The committee would meet in Florida during spring training. Beginning in 1995, the Veterans Committee rules were changed to elect as many as two executives, managers, umpires, and older major league

players, with separate ballots for candidates from the Negro leagues and from the 19th century.

24. Jack O'Connell, "Hungry for More Offense? Dig In," *Hartford Courant*, February 18, 2001.

25. Bob Rubl, "Lack of Dedication? Don't Accuse Tony Kubek," *Daily Oklahoman*, April 1, 1978.

26. [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/1984\\_Baseball\\_Hall\\_of\\_Fame\\_balloting](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/1984_Baseball_Hall_of_Fame_balloting).

27. [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/2002\\_Baseball\\_Hall\\_of\\_Fame\\_balloting](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/2002_Baseball_Hall_of_Fame_balloting).

28. Bill Madden, "Hall of Famers Pitch Shutout," *New York Daily News*, February 27, 2003. Among 85 eligible voters, 79 cast ballots so 60 votes were the minimum to elect a candidate.

29. Jay Jaffe, "Marvin Miller's Exclusion a Mark of Shame for the Hall of Fame," *Sports Illustrated*, November 27, 2012. <https://www.si.com/mlb/2012/11/27/marvin-miller-hall-of-fame>.

30. Balloting was conducted by mail in January 2007, with voters permitted to vote for up to 10 candidates from each ballot; all candidates who received at least 75 percent of the vote would be elected. Results of the voting by the Veterans Committee were announced on February 27, 2007.

31. With the 2007 rules changes, the composite ballot was split into two separate ballots—one for managers and umpires and the other for executives. Also, the voting membership of the Committee, which previously included all living members of the Hall, was now reduced to include just a handful of those members, plus additional executives and sportswriters (only one of whom had been among the previous electorate). Voting for both the managers/umpires and executives ballots would now take place prior to inductions in even-numbered years, starting with 2008. To be eligible, managers and umpires need to be retired for at least five years, or for at least six months if they are age 65 or older, while executives need to be either retired or at least age 65. The Committee was comprised of Hall of Fame players Monte Irvin, Harmon Killebrew, Executives and owners Bobby Brown, John Harrington, Jerry Bell, Bill DeWitt, Bill Giles, David Glass, and Andy MacPhail, and media representatives Paul Hagen, Rick Hummel, Hal McCoy. Voting was conducted at baseball's winter meetings in Nashville on December 2, 2007, with the results announced on December 3; it was the first time since 2001 that the Committee met to discuss candidates, as the previous three elections had been conducted by mail.

32. Patrick Oster, "David Glass, Former Walmart CEO Who Bought Royals, Dies at 84," *Bloomberg*, January 17, 2020; <https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2020-01-17/david-glass-former-walmart-ceo-who-bought-royals-dies-at-84>; C. Trent Rosecrans, "Kauffman Stadium to Keep Its Name for Now," *CBS Sports*, April 6, 2012, <https://www.cbssports.com/mlb/news/four-mlb-storylines-to-watch-on-memorial-day-including-alex-coras-return-to-houston>.

33. "Kuhn, 3 Others Going Into Baseball Hall," *Philadelphia Inquirer*, December 4, 2007.

34. Jerry Crasnick, "Time for Miller's Call from the Hall," *ESPN*, November 30, 2009, [http://www.espn.com/mlb/columns/story?columnist=crasnick\\_jerry&id=4700428](http://www.espn.com/mlb/columns/story?columnist=crasnick_jerry&id=4700428).

35. Allen Barra, "Hall of Shame," *Village Voice*, November 27, 2007, <https://www.villagevoice.com/2007/11/27/hall-of-shame/>.

36. Allen Barra, "Players Need to Make Stand for Marvin Miller," *New York Sun*, June 16, 2008, <https://www.nysun.com/sports/players-need-to-make-stand-for-marvin-miller/80069/>.

37. Fay Vincent, "Union Busting at the Hall of Fame," *New York Times*, December 8, 2007. <https://www.nytimes.com/2007/12/08/opinion/08vincent.html>.

38. Ronald Blum, "Miller Up for Hall Again After Several Snubs," *Ottawa Citizen*, December 6, 2010.

39. Associated Press and Jimmy Golen, "Kuhn, O'Malley and 3 Others Elected to Baseball Hall of Fame; Marvin Miller Snubbed," *San Jose Mercury-News*, December 3, 2007, <https://www.mercurynews.com/2007/12/03/kuhn-omalley-and-3-others-elected-to-baseball-hall-of-fame-marvin-miller-snubbed/>.

40. Emma Baccellieri, "Marvin Miller Didn't Want to Be a Hall of Famer. Now What?," *Sports Illustrated*, December 10, 2019, <https://www.si.com/mlb/2019/12/10/marvin-miller-hall-of-fame>.

41. William C. Rhoden, "Lion Who Made Players Roar Faces the Quiet," *The New York Times*, May 22, 2008, <https://www.nytimes.com/2008/05/22/sports/baseball/22rhoden.html>.

42. Voting was conducted at baseball's winter meetings in Indianapolis on December 6, 2009, with the results announced the next day; as was the case with the 2008 class of inductees, the Committee met to discuss the candidates, although the previous three elections had been conducted by mail. Committee members included players Robin Roberts and Tom Seaver; Executives and owners John Harrington, Jerry Bell, Bill DeWitt, Bill Giles, David Glass, Andy MacPhail, and John Schuerholz; and media representatives Rick Hummel, Hal McCoy, and Phil Pepe.

43. Jerry Crasnick, "Time for Miller's Call from the Hall," *ESPN*, November 30, 2009, [http://www.espn.com/mlb/columns/story?columnist=crasnick\\_jerry&id=4700428](http://www.espn.com/mlb/columns/story?columnist=crasnick_jerry&id=4700428).

44. The Committee convened at the 2010 winter meetings in Orlando. The results were announced on December 6. The Veterans Committee include Hall of fame manager, Whitey Herzog, Hall of Fame players, Eddie Murphy, Johnny Bench, Jim Palmer, Frank Robinson, Tony Perez, Ryne Sandberg, and Ozzie Smith, owners and executives Jerry Reinsdorf, Andy MacPhail, Bill Giles, and David Glass, and writers Tim Kurkjian, Bob Elliott, Tom Verducci, and Ross Newhan; Frank Fitzpatrick, "Miller Should Be in the Hall," *Philadelphia Inquirer*, January 27, 2011.

45. Allen Barra, "R.I.P., Marvin Miller, Baseball's FDR," *Salon*, November 28, 2012, [https://www.salon.com/2012/11/28/r\\_i\\_p\\_marvin\\_miller\\_baseballs\\_fdr/](https://www.salon.com/2012/11/28/r_i_p_marvin_miller_baseballs_fdr/).

46. Mike Lupica, "Legendary Baseball Union Leader Marvin Miller, Dead at 95, Belongs in Hall of Fame," *New York Daily News*, November 28, 2012, <https://www.nydailynews.com/sports/baseball/lupica-no-justice-miller-fails-find-fame-article-1.1209242>; Jay Jaffe, "Marvin Miller's Exclusion a Mark of Shame for the Hall of Fame," *Sports Illustrated*, November 27, 2012, <https://www.si.com/mlb/strike-zone/2012/11/27/marvin-miller-hall-of-fame>; Dahlia Lithwick, "Marvin Miller, 1917-2012: Cooperstown's Most Glaring Omission," *The New Republic*, November 27, 2012, <https://newrepublic.com/article/110506/marvin-miller-1917-2012-cooperstowns-most-glaring-omission>; Jerry Crasnick, "Time for Miller's Call from the Hall," *ESPN*, November 27, 2012, [http://www.espn.com/mlb/columns/story?columnist=crasnick\\_jerry&id=4700428](http://www.espn.com/mlb/columns/story?columnist=crasnick_jerry&id=4700428); Richard Sandomir, "Grudges Loomed Large in Hall of Fame Snubs of Miller," *New York Times*, November 27, 2012, [https://www.nytimes.com/2012/11/28/sports/baseball/marvin-miller-grudges-likely-played-role-in-hall-of-fame-snob.html?ref=baseball&\\_r=0](https://www.nytimes.com/2012/11/28/sports/baseball/marvin-miller-grudges-likely-played-role-in-hall-of-fame-snob.html?ref=baseball&_r=0); Peter Dreier, "Marvin Miller's Lasting Legacy," *American Prospect*, December 1, 2012 <https://prospect.org/culture/marvin-miller-s-lasting-legacy/>.

47. Thomas Boswell, "Marvin Miller Spoke Truth to Power, Changed Sports Forever," *Washington Post*, November 27, 2012, [https://www.washingtonpost.com/sports/nationals/marvin-miller-spoke-truth-to-power-changed-sports-forever/2012/11/27/3129b724-38cb-11e2-a263-f0ebffed2f15\\_story.html?utm\\_term=.eb9b93a65953](https://www.washingtonpost.com/sports/nationals/marvin-miller-spoke-truth-to-power-changed-sports-forever/2012/11/27/3129b724-38cb-11e2-a263-f0ebffed2f15_story.html?utm_term=.eb9b93a65953).

48. Fay Vincent, "Miller Earned Respect as He Stood for Players' Rights," *The New York Times*, November 27, 2012. <https://www.nytimes.com/2012/11/28/sports/baseball/fay-vincent-marvin-miller-baseball-hall-of-fame.html>.

49. The ballot for election by the 16-member Expansion Era Committee was released on November 4, 2013, and the Hall of Fame announced the results on December 9, 2013. The committee was comprised of six Hall of Fame players (Rod Carew, Carlton Fisk, Joe Morgan, Paul Molitor, Phil Niekro, Frank Robinson), two managers (Whitey Herzog and Tommy Lasorda), four executives (Paul Beeston, Andy MacPhail, Dave Montgomery, Jerry Reinsdorf), and four historians and media representatives ( Steve Hirdt, Bruce Jenkins, Jack O'Connell, Jim Reeves). "Baseball Hall of Fame 2014: Marvin Miller's Exclusion 'Simply Absurd,'" *Sporting News*, December 9, 2013, <https://www.sportingnews.com/us/mlb/news/baseball-hall-of-fame-2014-marvin-millers-exclusion-simply-absurd/10eg3icq8d5v91aelu7rab3v9o>.

50. <https://baseballhall.org/hall-of-famers/rules/eras-committees>; <https://web.archive.org/web/20130111222033/http://baseballhall.org/hall-famers/rules-election/eras-expansion>.

51. The 10 candidates on the 2017 Modern Baseball Era ballot were Miller, Jack Morris, Alan Trammell, Ted Simmons, Steve Garvey, Tommy John, Don Mattingly, Dale Murphy, Dave Parker, and Luis Tiant. Morris and Trammell were elected with 14 and 13 votes, respectively. Simmons had 11. Miller 7. The 10 candidates on the 2019 Modern Baseball Era ballot were Miller, Ted Simmons, Dwight Evans, Dave Parker, Steve Garvey, Lou Whitaker, Tommy John, Don Mattingly, Thurman Munson, and Dale Murphy. Simmons and Miller were elected with 13 and 12 votes, respectively.

52. The committee included six major league executives (Sandy Alderson, Paul Beeston, Bob Castellini, Bill DeWitt, David Glass, and John Schuerholz) and six former players (George Brett, Rod Carew, Dennis Eckersley, Don Sutton, Dave Winfield, and Robin Yount) as well as one former manager (Bobby Cox) and three media representatives (Bob Elliott, a former sportswriter for several Canadian newspapers before he retired in 2016; Jayson Stark, a baseball writer who worked for the *Philadelphia Inquirer*, then ESPN, and then *The Athletic*; and Steve Hirdt, VP of Elias Sports Bureau, which provides MLB with its essential statistics. He's a former sportswriter, although the Hall of Fame describes him as an "historian").

53. Interview with Dennis Eckersley, June 5, 2021.

54. Interview with Eckersley.

55. Tributes to Miller from many former players and others can be found on the "Thanks, Marvin" website created in 2010 by former MLB pitcher Bob Locker: <http://thanksmarvin.com/>; A sample of the others includes the following: Ira Berkow, "Marvin Miller, Hall of Famer," *The New York Times*, February 15, 1999. <https://www.nytimes.com/1999/02/15/sports/sports-of-the-times-marvin-miller-hall-of-famer.html>; Allen Barra, "Marvin Miller's Fame Is Subject to Interpretation," *The New York Times*, February 20, 2000. <https://www.nytimes.com/2000/02/20/sports/backtalk-marvin-miller-s-fame-is-subject-to-interpretation.html>; Allen Barra, "Marin Miller, Hall of Famer," *Salon*, January 3, 2001, [https://www.salon.com/2001/01/03/miller\\_15/](https://www.salon.com/2001/01/03/miller_15/); Allen Barra, "Is It Miller Time at Baseball Hall of Fame?" *Wall Street Journal*, February 25, 2003; Allen Barra, "Runnin' Scared: Once Against, One of Baseball's Greatest Is Kept from Cooperstown," *Village Voice*, November 27, 2007; Allen Barra, "Players Need to Make Stand for Marvin Miller," *New York Sun*, June 16, 2008, <https://www.nysun.com/sports/players-need-to-make-stand-for-marvin-miller/80069/>; Peter Dreier and Kelly Candaele, "Hall of Fame Shut Out," *The Nation*, August 4, 2008, <https://www.thenation.com/article/hall-fame-shut-out/>; Joe Posnanski, "There's No Worse Hall of Fame Omission Than That of Marvin Miller," *Sports Illustrated*, January 14, 2010, <https://www.si.com/more-sports/2010/01/14/marvin-miller>; Jerry Crasnick, "Time for Miller's Call from the Hall," *ESPN*, November 30, 2009, [http://www.espn.com/mlb/columns/story?columnist=crasnick\\_jerry&id=4700428](http://www.espn.com/mlb/columns/story?columnist=crasnick_jerry&id=4700428); Allen Barra, "R.I.P., Marvin Miller, Baseball's FDR," *Salon*, November 28, 2012, [https://www.salon.com/2012/11/28/r\\_i\\_p\\_marvin\\_miller\\_baseballs\\_fdr](https://www.salon.com/2012/11/28/r_i_p_marvin_miller_baseballs_fdr); Associated Press, "Former Players Urge Marvin Miller Be Put in Hall of Fame," *Sports Illustrated*, January 21, 2013, <https://www.si.com/mlb/2013/01/21/marvin-miller-baseball-hall-fame>; Bill Shaiken, "Joe Torre, Union Rip Exclusion of Marvin Miller from Hall of Fame," *Los Angeles Times*, December 9, 2013, <https://www.latimes.com/sports/sportsnow/la-sp-sn-joe-torre-union-leader-marvin-miller-from-hall-of-fame-20131209-story.html>; Jay Jaffe, "The Hall of Fame Is Incomplete Without Marvin Miller," *Sports Illustrated*, November 19, 2017, <https://amp.si.com/mlb/2017/11/16/marvin-miller-hall-fame-modern-baseball-ballot>; Peter Botte, "Marvin Miller's Repeated Hall of Fame Snub Is Unfathomable" *New York Daily News*, December 11, 2017, <https://www.nydailynews.com/sports/baseball/botte-shots-marvin-miller-repeated-hof-snub-unfathomable-article-1.3690463>; Rob Neyer, "Marvin Miller Is the Poster Boy for a Larger Baseball Hall of Fame Dilemma," *Yahoo Sports*, January 23, 2018, <https://sports.yahoo.com/marvin-miller-poster-boy-larger-baseball-hall-fame-dilemma-050728433.html>; William C. Rhoden, "Lion Who Made Players Roar Faces

the Quiet," *The New York Times*, May 22, 2008, <https://www.nytimes.com/2008/05/22/sports/baseball/22rhoden.html>.

56. Blackie Sherrod, "Express Chugs on Changeup," *Calgary Herald*, March 19, 1999.

57. Bill Madden, "O's Are Drawing Ooh, Ahs," *New York Daily News*, May 10, 1992.

58. <http://www.mingster.org/speech.htm>; "Ryan Has Miller to Thank for Raises," *Palm Beach Post*, July 26, 1999.

59. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QUjfOUy5jnw>.

60. Quoted in the "Thanks, Marvin" website: <http://thanksmarvin.com/>.

61. Allen Barra, "Marvin Miller, Hall of Famer," *Salon*, January 4, 2001. [https://www.salon.com/2001/01/03/miller\\_15/](https://www.salon.com/2001/01/03/miller_15/).

62. Ira Berkow, "Marvin Miller, Hall of Famer," *The New York Times*, February 15, 1999. <https://www.nytimes.com/1999/02/15/sports/sports-of-the-times-marvin-miller-hall-of-famer.html>.

63. Allen Barra, "Marvin Miller's Fame Is Subject to Interpretation," *The New York Times*, February 20, 2000. <https://www.nytimes.com/2000/02/20/sports/backtalk-marvin-miller-s-fame-is-subject-to-interpretation.html>.

64. Bill Shaiken, "Joe Torre, Union Rip Exclusion of Marvin Miller from Hall of Fame," *Los Angeles Times*, December 9, 2013, <https://www.latimes.com/sports/sportsnow/la-sp-sn-joe-torre-union-leader-marvin-miller-from-hall-of-fame-20131209-story.html>.

65. Allen Barra, "Marin Miller, Hall of Famer," *Salon*, January 3, 2001, [https://www.salon.com/2001/01/03/miller\\_15/](https://www.salon.com/2001/01/03/miller_15/).

66. "Former Players Urge Marvin Miller Be Put in Hall of Fame," *Sports Illustrated*, January 21, 2013, <https://www.si.com/mlb/2013/01/21/marvin-miller-baseball-hall-fame>.

67. Gorden Edes, "Ex-Labor Chief Flattered by Hall Talk," *Boston Globe*, December 15, 2002.

68. Letter from Ray Grebey to Baseball Hall of Fame Board of Directors, December 8, 2009, <http://thanksmarvin.com/Grebey-letters.pdf>.

69. Phil Rosenthal, "Hall of Fame Honoree Bob Costas Calls Marvin Miller Its 'Most Glaring Omission,'" *Chicago Tribune*, December 14, 2017, <https://www.chicagotribune.com/sports/breaking/ct-spt-bob-costas-hall-of-fame-marvin-miller-rosenthal-20171214-story.html>.

70. Jerry Crasnick, "Time for Miller's Call from the Hall," *ESPN*, November 30, 2009, [http://www.espn.com/mlb/columns/story?columnist=crasnick\\_jerry&id=4700428](http://www.espn.com/mlb/columns/story?columnist=crasnick_jerry&id=4700428).

71. Fay Vincent, "Miller Earned Respect as He Stood for Players' Rights" *the New York Times*, November 27, 2012, <https://www.nytimes.com/2012/11/28/sports/baseball/fay-vincent-marvin-miller-baseball-hall-of-fame.html>.

72. Jerry Crasnick, "Time for Miller's Call from the Hall," *ESPN*, November 30, 2009, [http://www.espn.com/mlb/columns/story?columnist=crasnick\\_jerry&id=4700428](http://www.espn.com/mlb/columns/story?columnist=crasnick_jerry&id=4700428). Selig made a similar statement in December 2010, right before the committee once again rejected Miller. Ronald Blum, "Miller Up for Hall Again After Several Snubs," *Ottawa Citizen*, December 6, 2010.

73. David Laurila, "Who on the Modern Era Ballot Belongs in the Hall of Fame," *Fangraphs*, December 8, 2017, <https://blogs.fangraphs.com/writers-view-who-on-the-modern-era-ballot-belongs-in-the-hall-of-fame/>.

74. David Laurila, "Who on the Modern Era Ballot Belongs in the Hall of Fame," *Fangraphs*, December 8, 2017, <https://blogs.fangraphs.com/writers-view-who-on-the-modern-era-ballot-belongs-in-the-hall-of-fame/>.

75. Results of the committee's voting were announced on December 8, 2019.

76. <https://baseballhall.org/about-the-hall/staff/board-of-directors>.

77. Richard Sandomir, "Cooperstown's Steadiest Hand Isn't a Hall of Famer's," *The New York Times*, July 24, 2015, <https://www.nytimes.com/2015/07/25/sports/baseball/clark-familys-quiet-fame-and-wealthy-legacy-abide-at-cooperstown.html>.

78. <http://www.alumni.pace.edu/s/1655/02-alumni/social.aspx?sid=1655&gid=2&pgid=629>.

79. In August 2019, Glass agreed to sell the team to Cleveland Indians vice chairman John Sherman, pending approval from Major League Baseball and its remaining owners.

80. <https://www.forbes.com/profile/arturo-moreno/#6ce26b11eccc>.

81. <https://www.forbes.com/profile/jerry-reinsdorf/#5a34ef06d28c>.

82. <https://www.forbes.com/profile/thomas-tull/#703dcad47645>.

83. As of 2018, there were 70 living Hall of Fame ex-players. Of the 51 of them who played while Miller headed the MLBPA, only 14 have made campaign contributions to candidates for president or Congress, according to data in OpenSecrets.org. Lou Brock, Hank Aaron, Dave Winfield, Bruce Sutter, Andrew Dawson, and Paul Molitor donated to Democrats. Nolan Ryan, Jack Morris, Gaylord Perry, Johnny Bench, Bert Blyleven, Robin Young, and George Brett. Wade Boggs' only donation was to the Safari Club International, a hunters group, in 2010.

84. In an interview, Mead did not acknowledge playing any role in orchestrating Miller's election. Interview with Tim Mead, June 4, 2021.

85. Jocketty, born in 1951, worked as director of minor league operations and scouting for the Oakland A's starting in 1980, two years before Miller retired. In 1985, he was promoted to Director of Baseball Administration. In 1994, he briefly served as Assistant General Manager for the Colorado Rockies. From 1994 to 2007 he was the general manager for the St. Louis Cardinals and served in the same position for the Cincinnati Reds from 2008 to 2015, and then became the team's President. Dave Dombrowski, born in 1956, was briefly the White Sox' assistant GM in the 1980s, then served as GM and president for the Expos, Marlins, and Red Sox. (He joined the Phillies as their president in 2020), Doug Melvin, born in 1952, is a former minor league player. He spent nearly a decade (1987–94) as assistant general manager and director of player development for the Baltimore Orioles, then served as general manager with Texas Rangers (1994–2001), before coming the general manager for the Milwaukee Brewers in 2002, serving until 2015. Terry Ryan, born in 1953, was another former minor league player who became a scout and then moved into the executive suite. He was the Twins GM from 1994 to 2007 and again from 2011 to 2016.

86. Interview with Dennis Eckersley, June 5, 2021.

87. "Union Exec Marvin Miller, Simmons Elected to Hall of Fame," *USA Today*, December 8, 2019, <https://www.usatoday.com/story/sports/mlb/2019/12/08/union-exec-marvin-miller-simmons-elected-to-hall-of-fame/40784865/>.

88. Murray Chass, "George's Letter Good Sign for Marvin," *Murray Chass on Baseball*, December 9, 2019. <http://www.murraychass.com/?p=12262>.

89. Sandy Koufax, Whitey Ford, Willie Mays, Hank Aaron, Luis Aparicio, Al Kaline, Bob Gibson, Bill Mazeroski, Brooks Robinson, Orlando Cepeda, Juan Marichal, Billy Williams, Gaylord Perry, Phil Neikro, Lou Brock, Carl Yastrzemski, Tony Perez, Joe Morgan, Steve Carlton, Don Sutton, Jim Palmer, and Nolan Ryan.

90. Tom Seaver, Rod Carew, Reggie Jackson, Rollie Fingers, Johnny Bench, Carlton Fisk, Mike Schmidt, Bert Blyleven, Goose Gossage, Dave Winfield, Bruce Sutter, Jim Rice, George Brett, Andre Dawson, Dennis Eckersley, Ozzie Smith, Jack Morris, Robin Yount, Eddie Murray, Paul Molitor, Alan Trammell, Wade Boggs, Rickey Henderson, Tim Lincecum, Ryne Sandberg, and Cal Ripken <https://baseballhall.org/media/living-hall-of-famers>.

91. David Waldstein, "With Nods to the Past, Gerrit Cole Embraces His Yankees Future," *The New York Times*, December 18, 2019, <https://www.nytimes.com/2019/12/18/sports/baseball/gerrit-cole-yankees.html>; Kristie Ackert, "Gerrit Cole Knows His Labor History, Thanks Curt Flood and Marvin Miller," *New York Daily News*, December 18, 2019, <https://www.nydailynews.com/sports/baseball/yankees/ny-gerrit-cole-free-agency-marvin-miller-curt-flood-20191218-sweqaznlajcudci4bhslibik43a-story.html>.